Competency-Based Education
Separating Fact from Fiction

Megan Adams, PhD
Research Consultant
madams@eab.com
For Additional Information

Megan Adams, PhD
Consultant
202-266-5562
madams@eab.com

Kimpton Langford
Manager
202-909-4285
klangford@eab.com
## The Advisory Board Company by the Numbers

### Our Parent Company

### Firm Facts

**Established**
- 1979

**Employees**
- 2,200+

**Headquarters and Offices**
- Washington, DC
- San Francisco
- Chicago
- Austin
- London
- Ann Arbor
- Nashville
- Chennai

### Our Members

- **4,000+** Hospitals and Health Systems
- **1,100+** College and University Memberships
- **100,000+** Executives Served
- **100+** Student Success Collaborative Members

### Our Service Offerings

#### Best Practice Research
- **150+** Annual Major Strategy Studies
- **15,000+** Annual Customized Research Reports

#### Business Intelligence and Analytics
- **20+** Software Platforms
- **1,000+** Software-as-a-Service “Installations”

#### Consulting Services
- **2,000+** Onsite and Consulting Engagements
## Private Research Universities
- American University
- Baylor University
- Boston College
- Boston University
- Brown University
- California Institute of Technology
- Carnegie Mellon University
- Cornell University
- Dartmouth University
- DePaul University
- Duke University
- Georgetown University
- The George Washington University
- Harvard University
- Johns Hopkins University
- New York University
- Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute
- Syracuse University
- Texas Christian University
- University of Dayton
- University of Miami
- University of Notre Dame
- University of Pennsylvania

## Private Masters and Baccalaureate Institutions
- Bob Jones University
- Bryant University
- Butler University
- College of Saint Rose
- Creighton University
- Drake University
- Elon University
- Gallaudet University
- Gonzaga University
- La Salle University
- Loyola Marymount University
- Marymount University
- Quinnipiac University
- Rochester Institute of Technology
- Roosevelt University
- Simmons College
- Thomas Jefferson University
- University of Indianapolis
- University of New England

## Public Research Universities
- Arizona State University
- Colorado School of Mines
- Colorado State University
- East Carolina University
- Georgia Institute of Technology
- Indiana University
- Kansas State University
- New Mexico State University
- Oregon State University
- Rutgers University
- University of Alabama at Birmingham
- University of California, Berkeley
- University of California, Davis
- University of California, San Diego
- University of Colorado at Boulder
- University of Connecticut
- University of Delaware
- University of Florida
- University of Georgia
- University of Iowa
- University of Kansas
- University of Maryland
- University of Massachusetts, Amherst
- University of Missouri-Columbia
- University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
- University of Oregon
- University of South Carolina, Columbia
- University of Utah
- University of Virginia
- University of Washington
- Virginia Polytechnic Institute & State University
- Auburn University
- Ball State University
- Bowling Green State University
- Clemson University
- Georgia State University

## Public Masters Universities
- Boise State University
- California Polytechnic State University
- California State University-Long Beach
- California State University-Northridge
- University of British Columbia
- University of Calgary
- University of Guelph
- University of Manitoba
- University of Montreal
- University of Nottingham
- University of Toronto

## International Institutions
- Algonquin College of Allied Arts and Technology
- Carleton University
- Centennial College
- Dalhousie University
- Langara College
- Memorial University of Newfoundland
- McGill University
- McMaster University
- Ryerson University
- Simon Fraser University
- University of British Columbia
- University of Calgary
- University of Guelph
- University of Manitoba
- University of Montreal
- University of Nottingham
- University of Toronto
- University of British Columbia
- University of Calgary
- University of Guelph
- University of Manitoba
- University of Montreal
- University of Nottingham
- University of Toronto
Who Do We Serve in Higher Education?

**Academic Affairs Forum**
Research for provosts and senior academic administrators on strategies for elevating performance in teaching, research, and academic administration

**Business Affairs Forum**
Research and performance benchmarks for administration and finance executives charged with improving performance and increasing administrative efficiency

**Student Affairs Forum**
Research for student affairs executives on strategies and best practices for improving performance across student affairs and perfecting the student experience

**COE Forum**
Research, analytics, and market intelligence for deans and other executives charged with creating flexible, innovative educational programs that serve working adult needs

**Advancement Forum**
Research and data analytics to help advancement professionals maximize philanthropic giving and support institutional goals

**IT Forum**
Research and advice for CIOs and IT leaders on leveraging information, systems, processes, and technology in the higher education mission

**Student Success Collaborative**
Predictive modeling, degree tracking, and consulting to help institutions improve student retention and completion

**University Spend Collaborative**
Business intelligence, price comparison database, and consulting to assist chief procurement officers in reducing spend on purchased goods and services
What Do We Mean By Best Practice?

Chronology of an Education Advisory Board Study—from Member Problem to Best Practice Report

Number of Universities Included at Each Stage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>All members</th>
<th>3,000+ universities</th>
<th>150–200 universities</th>
<th>50–70 universities</th>
<th>12–30 universities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annual Topic Selection</td>
<td>Literature Review and Interviews</td>
<td>Screening for Best Practices</td>
<td>In-Depth Case Study Research</td>
<td>Original Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A new research agenda is developed each year through meetings and surveys across the membership. As a result, the research is always fresh and focused on the most critical issues facing colleges and universities.</td>
<td>In-depth interviews and onsites are conducted at these organizations to run deep in what they are doing. The research focuses on understanding at a granular level of detail how each practice works, resource requirements, implementation requirements, benefits, and potential drawbacks.</td>
<td>Interviews are conducted with all potential best practice organizations to assess whether they merit further study. <em>Is the practice truly innovative? Can it demonstrate results?</em> This process winnows the list to those organizations most likely to yield true best practices.</td>
<td>A massive literature review and extensive round of interviews with college administrators, consultants, and experts in the field help with a deeper understanding of the topic under study and provide a preliminary list of potential best practice candidates.</td>
<td>The lion’s share of preparing a study involves a search for “right answers” for the membership. Through rigorous root cause analysis and synthesis of all information at hand, analysts isolate the freshest insights and most original ideas for presentation to the membership.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Report Content

- Best demonstrated practices are profiled in depth. Practices are described and presented in a manner that provides members with enough detail and instruction to implement them in their own universities.

Format

- Reports are written with the view that few administrators have any meaningful time to read. Concise blocks of text are supported by liberal use of graphics, charts, timelines, and flow diagrams.

Best Practice Implementation Support

- Diagnostic templates and benchmarks typically can be found throughout most reports or as an appendix. These tools and benchmarks allow members to identify which root cause problems—and associated practices—merit immediate attention.

- Applicability audits and questionnaires allow members to target those particular ideas most applicable to their own universities for further consideration and implementation.

- Collateral materials collected from case study colleges—actual scripts, college plans, job descriptions, budgets, educational materials, and the like—are appended to provide members with templates they can customize to their own circumstances.
Expertise in Higher Ed’s Most Pressing Issues

**Academic Affairs Forum**

- Hardwiring Student Success: Building Disciplines for Retention and Timely Graduation
- Smart Growth: Running the Academy by the Numbers
- Redefining the Academic Library: Managing the Migration to Digital Information Services
- Breaking the Trade-off Between Cost and Quality
- Assessing Student Learning Outcomes: Best Practices for Engaging the Faculty
- Making the Global Vision Real: Supporting Faculty-led Internationalization Efforts
- Future Students, Future Revenues
- Developing Academic Leaders: Cultivating the Skills of Chairs, Deans, and Other Faculty Administrators

**Continuing and Online Education Forum**

- Reaching “Search and Shop” Students
- Recruiting the Silent Funnel
- Disciplining Social Media Strategy
- Evaluating and Implementing Partnerships with Online Program Enablement Vendors
- The Path to Persistence
- Creating T-Shaped Professionals
- Hyper-stackable Emerging Careers
- Designing Programs for the Millennial Workforce
- Industry Insights – Big Data
- Breakthrough Opportunities in Health Care Programs
Competency-Based Education
Separating Fact from Fiction

Megan Adams, PhD
Research Consultant
madams@eab.com
d.School Exhibit Looks Back from the Year 2100

Stanford’s Invitation to Travel through Time

**Purpose Learning**
*Declaring Mission, Not Majors*
- From “I’m studying biology” to “I’m studying biology so I can eliminate world hunger”
- Impact Labs around globe

**Paced Education**
*Beyond the “Get Through It” Mentality*
- 3 self-paced phases (6-24 months): Calibration, Elevation, Activation
- GritBit—temporary tattoo tracks stress, learning goals

**Axis Flip**
*Competencies, Not Disciplines*
- Organized around competency hubs (communication, quantitative reasoning)
- “Skill print” for employers

**Open Loop**
*6 Years over a Lifetime*
- Leave when “outside loop” more meaningful; pitch re-entry when needed
- Expert practitioners return to campus

---

**Four Alternate Higher Ed Futures, Two Common Threads**
- Curriculum and outcomes better matched to jobs
- Timing and content personalized to individual needs

Passing Fad or Inevitability?

“The #Edu14 drinking game: sure inebriation in 13 from vendor claims of ‘mooc’ ‘cloud’ or ‘disrupting edu’. In 2014: ‘competency based.’”

@readmeray

Community colleges plan to offer quick competency degree (Seattle Times, 5/2014)

Competency-Based Education: No More Semesters? (NPR, 10/2014)

From recession’s wake, education innovation blooms (Chicago Sun Times, 8/2013)

Traditional ways upended in college of competence (The Boston Globe, 4/2013)

Competency-based health credentials from the University of Texas System (Inside Higher Education, 11/2014)

Lumina-funded group leads conversation on competency-based education (Inside Higher Education, 9/2014)

20 Colleges Are Picked for Effort on Competency-Based Education (The Chronicle of Higher Education, 3/2014)

Competency-Based Degrees: Coming Soon to a Campus Near You (The Chronicle of Higher Education, 2/2014)

Accreditors’ role in the expansion of competency-based education (Inside Higher Education, 9/2014)

Where’s the teacher? Online college debuts self-paced courses (Minneapolis Star Tribune, 10/2013)

Competency-Based Learning: A Big Deal, But Not Because of the Feds (Huffington Post, 4/2013)

Competency-Based Education is the Disruptive Innovation for Higher Education (EDUCAUSE, 11/2014)

Competency-based education arrives at three major public institutions (Inside Higher Education, 10/2014)

From recession’s wake, education innovation blooms (Chicago Sun Times, 8/2013)

Traditional ways upended in college of competence (The Boston Globe, 4/2013)

Competency-based health credentials from the University of Texas System (Inside Higher Education, 11/2014)

Lumina-funded group leads conversation on competency-based education (Inside Higher Education, 9/2014)

20 Colleges Are Picked for Effort on Competency-Based Education (The Chronicle of Higher Education, 3/2014)

Competency-Based Degrees: Coming Soon to a Campus Near You (The Chronicle of Higher Education, 2/2014)

Accreditors’ role in the expansion of competency-based education (Inside Higher Education, 9/2014)

Where’s the teacher? Online college debuts self-paced courses (Minneapolis Star Tribune, 10/2013)

Competency-Based Learning: A Big Deal, But Not Because of the Feds (Huffington Post, 4/2013)

Competency-Based Education is the Disruptive Innovation for Higher Education (EDUCAUSE, 11/2014)

Competency-based education arrives at three major public institutions (Inside Higher Education, 10/2014)
No Longer Just Outliers

Coming Soon to an Institution Like You

Partial List of COE Forum Interviewees with CBE Programs or Launch Plans

“Three of our peer institutions recently made headlines with new CBE programs. I’m starting to feel the pressure. All it takes is one more peer school to launch CBE, and I’ll be asked why we don’t already have a program in the works?”

Associate Provost, Research University

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
Before Racing for Grant Dollars

While competency-based programs are now the exception, “I want them to be the norm.”


Top-Level Support + Public and Private Funding ≠ Guaranteed Success

Critical Questions for Each Institution

- Will we be able to afford the costs when our grant runs out?
- Is this right for our students?
  - Is there demand?
  - Can we help them succeed?
- Are we ready?
  - Back-office
  - Faculty

Next Generation Learning Challenges
$14M program funding tech-enabled innovation—Breakthrough Delivery Models including College for America and NAU Personalized Learning

First in World Grants
$75M program to support innovations that increase access and completion and make college more affordable ($1.5M to $4M over 48 months)
Framing the Campus Conversation

Simultaneously Avoiding “Me Too” and “It Won’t Happen Here” Syndromes

Today's Agenda

Managing the Near-Term Hype Cycle

- Defining our terms
- Understanding student and employer demand
- Sizing institutional effort needed to achieve CBE success
- Personalized learning without CBE

Hype Cycle for New Innovations

Exuberant Expectations
“Join the bandwagon or be left behind”

Disillusionment and Disinvestment
“Where are the results?”

Lasting Changes to Business Model
“This innovation allows us to provide new-in-kind value to our customers.”

Most organizations give up.

Most organizations overestimate near-term benefits …

…while under-estimating the long-term impact

Source: Jackie Fenn and Mark Rasking, Mastering the Hype Cycle: How to Choose the Right Innovation at the Right Time, Boston, MA: Garter, 2008; EAB interviews and analysis.
Before We Begin—Defining Our Terms

Dozens of Confusing Connotations

When Colleges and Universities Talk About Competency-Based Education, They Might Mention….

- Outcomes-based design
- Project-based multi-disciplinary curriculum
- Prior learning assessment
- Self-paced courses
- Flipped classroom
- Authentic assessment
- Psychometrics
- Digital portfolios
- Direct assessment

- Personalized learning
- Unbundled faculty roles
- Skills-based competencies
- Adaptive technologies
- Backwards design
- Success coaches
- Subscription pricing
- Employer-driven outcomes
- Active learning
- Learning analytics

A Tower of Babel
- Each term has multiple definitions
- Each CBE program emphasizes different components
- Not new ideas or CBE-specific—often, just good pedagogy

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
Defining Our Terms

Today’s Working Definition

Academic credit awarded based on mastery of clearly-defined competencies, rather than on “seat time”

In traditional education, time is fixed, and mastery is variable. In CBE, mastery is fixed, and time is variable.

Technology affords each student a distinct pathway through content based on what they know/don’t know and where they need most support—”personalization at scale”

Variations on Pacing

- Course must be completed in fixed time, but pacing within varies
- Total course span personalized—can take 5 or 15 weeks

Variations on Content

- Extra “hints” or recommended content based on areas where student is struggling
- Different content pathway (type, amount, and order) based on needs determined through assessments

Goals:

- Expand access through lower cost
- Expand access through flexibility
- Improve learning and career outcomes

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
## Similar, But Not the Same

### Top 3 Terms Most Commonly Mistaken for CBE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Prior Learning Assessment</strong></td>
<td>Institutions assess and award credit for learning gained outside traditional classroom experiences, typically prior to student enrollment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Direct Assessment</strong></td>
<td>Specific Title IV designation that allows schools to distribute financial aid based on assessments of student learning, not credit hours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcomes-Based Learning</strong></td>
<td>Process whereby faculty and instructional design staff follow a standard framework for course and program design, oriented around well-defined learning outcomes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Additional EAB Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The PLA Playbook</strong></td>
<td>Toolkit for schools looking to build or expand PLA programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Federal Policy FAQ</strong></td>
<td>Clarifies common misconceptions about financial aid for CBE programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assessing Student Learning Outcomes</strong></td>
<td>EAB study about designing a learning outcomes strategy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Managing the Near-Term Hype Cycle

Roadmap for Discussion

1. Separating Fact from Fiction
   - Myth #1: Students and employers are demanding CBE
   - Myth #2: CBE programs are faster and lower-cost for students
   - Myth #3: CBE programs are lower-cost for higher education institutions

2. Reducing the Costs and Risks of Launch
   - Selecting the right program and learners

3. Personalized Learning Models
   - Hybrid CBE models
   - Personalized learning without CBE
   - Prior Learning Assessment
Are Students Looking for CBE Programs?

“Online Degree” Consistently Tops Search

We learned the hard way that most students have never heard the term ‘competency-based’ before. We spend a lot of time explaining.

Academic Program Director

Source: www.google.com/trends; EAB interviews and analysis.
First Movers De-Emphasizing CBE

EAB Analysis of Western Governors University Homepage Across the Years

1998
“WGU has eight new competency-based degrees and certificates.”

2004
“WGU offers convenient, flexible online education and is the only accredited U.S. university with competency-based, online degrees.”

2009
“Respected online degrees, flexible online study, affordable tuition, accelerated time to degree.”

2014
“Respected online degrees, flexible online study, affordable, lower tuition.”

1) Review of WGU website across time.
Clarifying Misperceptions

Still a Small Slice of the Pie at SNHU

“One of our board members keeps calling the president and saying, ‘I’m seeing advertisements for Southern New Hampshire everywhere—are we going to lose students to them if we don’t do competency-based education too?’

Provost, Public University

45+ BA/BS Programs
30+ MA/MS Programs
25+ Certificates

~20,700 Enrollments

2nd largest CBE program after WGU
CBE programs across country have 20-40 students; some in the hundreds (next-to-none aiming for more)

~1,300 Enrollments

Surprising Findings from Our Interviews with First Movers

No Clear Signals of Employer CBE Demand

What We Expected to Find

New Models of Employer-Customization

✓ Specific competencies matched to each job
✓ Employers design and review assessments
✓ Significant direct pipelines of students, hiring pathways for graduates

What We Heard—Look Familiar?

Industry Advisory Council feedback

Occasional phone conversation to discuss program

Program promoted (with others) on company internal site

Want vague skills: critical thinking and communication

No Ready-Made List of Employer Competencies

“During one focus group, HR staff and plant managers talked about what new graduates need to be able to do. Their message was, ‘We just need people who don’t do drugs and can work in teams.’”

Beth Laves, Associate VP, Division of Extended Learning and Outreach, Western Kentucky University

©2014 The Advisory Board Company • eab.com • 30059E

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
Managing the Near-Term Hype Cycle

1. Separating Fact from Fiction
   - Myth #1: Students and employers are demanding CBE
   - Myth #2: CBE programs are faster and lower-cost for students
   - Myth #3: CBE programs are lower-cost for higher education institutions

2. Reducing the Costs and Risks of Launch
   - Selecting the right program and learners

3. Personalized Learning Models
   - Hybrid CBE models
   - Personalized learning without CBE
   - Prior Learning Assessment

Roadmap for Discussion
### Overheard on Good Morning America

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Michelle, CfA</th>
<th>Dan, UW-Flex</th>
<th>Zach, CfA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Account rep at Anthem-BCBS</td>
<td>Senior programmer Wisc. Legislature</td>
<td>Sanitation worker at ConAgra plant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother of two</td>
<td>Aspiring neuroscientist</td>
<td>Manufactures Slim-Jims</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twenty-five years work experience</td>
<td>Sixteen years work experience</td>
<td>Twenty-one years old</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earned degree in 5 months</td>
<td>Earned 33 credits in 3 months</td>
<td>Earned degree in 100 days</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Indication that CBE can help meet completion goals?**

…But Are Michelle, Dan, and Zach the Norm?

How Often Can Degree Completers Speed Ahead?

Significant Barriers Already

“This is a student segment with low academic preparedness. We absolutely have to figure out how to support degree completers, but a CBE program—online, self-paced, demanding mastery of every concept—is going to be challenging for a student without developed study skills.

Schools launching CBE programs are doing it because they believe in the pedagogy, not because it’s an easy way to serve the degree completion market. It’s a lot harder.”

Dean, College of Continuing Education
Public Research University

Non-Completers Less Prepared than College Population

3x
Likelihood of possessing learning disability

6.6
Mean gap in self-reported composite ACT score

22%
Percentage point gap on Math/Verbal assessment

Lower Price Often Relies on Speed

Illustrative Example

Subscription Price Rewards Swift Pace…

The “All-you-can-learn” Price

$2,500

3-month subscription

…But Marginal Difference Between Costs

Comparison of Degree Completion Program Pricing

$20,000

two years at subscription price

vs

$24,000

two years at regular price

Not Necessarily Less Expensive

Across the Sector, Most Students Not Accelerating

Average Share of Students Accelerating in CBE

Only 10% – 15% of students accelerating

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
A Better Fit?

Searching for the Mythical Bookkeeper

We Lost Count the Number of Times This Came Up

"We're here for someone like a bookkeeper who's been working in a small business his whole life. With the [accounting] work he does every day, he can speed through and get a degree in no time."

Program Director, Public Institution

---

The Mythical Bookkeeper

- How many bookkeepers are in your state?
- How many bookkeepers can accelerate progress?
- How many bookkeepers want to go back to school?

---

Small Share National Workforce

Portrait of the Bookkeeper Workforce

- Masters or PhD: 3%
- Bachelors Degree: 15%
- Some College or Associates: 49%
- HS Equivalent or Less: 33%

Nearly 230k eligible for MBA
Fewer than 800k eligible for BA

Prior Experience ≠ Meaningful Acceleration

Typical BBA Curriculum

Only 13-16% of curriculum devoted to accounting

Percentage of curriculum devoted to accounting even smaller (6%) in typical CBE MBA
Managing the Near-Term Hype Cycle

Roadmap for Discussion

1. Separating Fact from Fiction
   - Myth #1: Students and employers are demanding CBE
   - Myth #2: CBE programs are faster and lower-cost for students
   - Myth #3: CBE programs are lower-cost for higher education institutions

2. Reducing the Costs and Risks of Launch
   - Selecting the right program and learners

3. Personalized Learning Models
   - Hybrid CBE models
   - Personalized learning without CBE
   - Prior Learning Assessment
Lessons from First-Movers

Unanticipated Expenses

Greater Time and Dollar Investment Than Anticipated

1. Student support personnel
   - Immature Vendor Market

2. Course design and development
   - Challenges of Self-Paced

3. Back-office infrastructure

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
#1: Anticipating Student Support Costs

“Our Faculty Were Buried”

Self-Paced Programs Require Even Greater Instructor Effort

_Instructor Workload (Illustrative)_

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>John</th>
<th>Jane</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Week 1</td>
<td>Stats 1</td>
<td>Stats 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Week 2</td>
<td>Stats 2</td>
<td>Stats 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Week 3</td>
<td>Stats 2</td>
<td>Stats 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Week 4</td>
<td>Stats 2</td>
<td>Stats 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Week 5</td>
<td>Stats 2</td>
<td>Stats 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Proactive outreach to ensure progress

*Individual calls/emails (and follow-up when no response)*

Rapid feedback to maintain pace

Switching costs between lessons

First Movers Find Success Coaches Necessary for Ensuring Progress

Quick Responses

- Answering logistical and administrative questions
- Alerting faculty when students have academic questions

Even small delays matter in a self-paced course

Personalized Planning

- Intake interview with students each term to set goals and timelines for work
- Weekly or bi-weekly check-ins on pacing throughout term

Added benefit: able to track stop-outs for financial aid

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
Examining the (Partial) Costs of Student Support

"Success coaches would be ideal for any program serving adult and online students, but it’s really an essential cost of doing business in CBE."

VPAA, Public University

Not Exactly “Scale” (Illustrative)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Traditional Faculty Model</th>
<th>Success Coach Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faculty Salary</td>
<td>$80,000</td>
<td>$80,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty Workload</td>
<td>1:40, 4/4</td>
<td>1:200, 4/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coach Salary</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>$35,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coach Workload</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1:150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$250</td>
<td>$283</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

cost per student           cost per student

Across All Program Sizes

In a Gallup study asking if students had a mentor guiding their hopes and dreams, 68% of WGU students said yes (compared to 22% nationally)

Personalized Learning Pathways

Responding to Learner Actions in Real-Time

Rule-Based Adaptive

- Branched learning paths following “if...then...” logic
- Example: Different required or recommended pathways for high-level, middle-of-road, and struggling learner

Algorithm-Based Adaptive

- Content sequence calculated dynamically—a different path for every learner

A True Production—Cue the Rolling Credits

- Faculty Member
- Instructional Architect
- Curriculum Specialist
- Assessment Specialists
- Instructional Designers
- Project Managers
- Quality Assurance Analyst
- Lead Media Designer
- Media
- Editing
- Production
- Learning Scientist

How Many Faculty Hours to An Adaptive Curriculum?

1,500 Hours
Per Course

86 Years
For All Gen Ed Courses

571 Years
For Typical University Entire Catalog

Still an Immature Vendor Market

The Million Dollar Question (Pun Intended)

One Early Mover’s Lessons Learned

“You can buy a lot of different pieces, but no one’s figured out how to put it all together or how to make it really work. We’ve already spent so much money we’re going to keep going, but we’d have been better off waiting.”

Program Director, Private Institution

Hedging Bets

ASU’s Adaptive Learning Partners

“IT’s too early to figure out whose analytics are best. We’re going to work with multiple vendors until we find someone doing things practical and scalable for multiple disciplines.”

Dale Johnson
Sr. Business Analyst, ASU Adaptive Learning

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
#3: Anticipating Back-Office Costs

Snippets from Our Research Conversations

**Student Billing**
Admin staff create bills by hand for each student.

**LMS Downloads**
Staff manually download student data from the LMS and input into the SIS.

**Course Enrollment**
Registrar staff manually input course enrollments into SIS after course completion.

**SIS Calendars**
Registrar staff manually generate calendars in SIS for weekly program start dates.

**Financial Aid Awards**
Admin staff create and mail financial aid award letters from word template.

**Course Exits**
Registrar staff input students withdraws into the SIS by hand.

“Creating a non-term program outside the traditional semester structure requires modification to almost every administrative aspect—from the student experience to official reporting.”

*Rebecca Garrett, Northern Arizona University*

**Enrollment Reporting**
IR staff manually re-shape enrollment files for IPEDS data upload.

**Student Tracking**
Institution uses excel document to track student interaction in courses for R2T4 compliance.

**Transcription**
Institution manually creates traditional transcript from course/module completion.

**Student Payments**
Bursar staff manually process student subscription payments.

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
## Key Takeaways

### Separating Fact from Fiction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Myths</th>
<th>Realities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grow Enrollments</td>
<td>Myth #1: Students and employers are demanding CBE</td>
<td>▪ Students aren’t searching for CBE programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Google trends shows “online programs” far more popular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Employers not more involved or making new demands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Myth #2: CBE programs are faster and lower-cost for students</td>
<td>▪ Most students take average time or longer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Students miss out on savings of “all you can eat” subscriptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree Completion</td>
<td>Myth #3: CBE programs are lower-cost for higher education institutions</td>
<td>▪ More expensive to implement than traditional programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and Affordability</td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ New technology needs, manual processes, and academic support staff add up fast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Savings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
Keeping Our Eye on When Costs and Risks Begin to Decrease

What We’ll Track On Your Behalf

Factors That Could Accelerate CBE Adoption...

**Rising Market Demand**

- Students “Shop” Based on Learning Experience
  - K12 changes
  - Informal learning (i.e., mobile apps)

- Superior Results from Earlier Movers
  - Success rates
  - Career outcomes

**Improving Outcomes, Reducing Costs**

- Automated Goal-Setting and Tracking
  - Personalized schedule based on goals, time available, level of mastery
  - Promoting self-discipline

- P2P Support
  - Proof of efficacy (academic and non-academic)
  - Technology platforms

- Automated Q&A
  - IBM-Watson technology to retrieve FAQ
  - Auto-curation of new content

- Faculty Acceptance of Off-the-Shelf Adaptive Courseware
  - Customization opportunities
  - Shifting perception of value

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
Managing the Near-Term Hype Cycle

Competency-Based Education

Roadmap for Discussion

1. Separating Fact from Fiction
   - Myth #1: Students and employers are demanding CBE
   - Myth #2: CBE programs are faster and lower-cost for students
   - Myth #3: CBE programs are lower-cost for higher education institutions

2. Reducing the Costs and Risks of Launch
   - Selecting the right program and learners

3. Personalized Learning Models
   - Hybrid CBE models
   - Personalized learning without CBE
   - Prior Learning Assessment
Selecting the Right Program to Launch

Students Most Likely to Succeed

Proven Learners
Students with a bachelor’s degree or higher
- Master’s and post-baccalaureate certificates

Relevant Work Experience
Career advancers rather than career changers
- Master’s in Strategic Communication
- Master’s of Business Analytics

Reducing Upfront Time Investment

Strong Outcomes History
Fields with long history of curriculum design based on outcomes
- Health professions

Certificates
Lower financial risk and upfront investment; faster completion for students
- Project Management Professional
- Digital Marketing

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
Lesson Learned from First Movers

New Emphasis on Learner Fit

Screening for Those Likely to Succeed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Challenge</th>
<th>Screen</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lacks fluency with online</td>
<td>Self-assessment; online test drive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lacks academic skills to succeed</td>
<td>Math/verbal assessment tests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doesn’t understand expectations of CBE</td>
<td>Series of Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doesn’t have self-paced discipline</td>
<td>Trial period? Psychometrics?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Soft Landing for Strugglers

Transfer Options

- FlexPath BBA ➔ Online BBA
- FlexPath MBA ➔ Online MBA
- FlexPath BS-IT ➔ Online BS-IT

Sample Redirection Review Triggers

- Repeated failure to pass competency evaluation
- Infrequent contact with assigned academic coach
- Pace not meeting satisfactory academic progress

Screening for all online programs (not just CBE)
CBE specific challenges

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
Managing the Near-Term Hype Cycle

Roadmap for Discussion

1. Separating Fact from Fiction
   - Myth #1: Students and employers are demanding CBE
   - Myth #2: CBE programs are faster and lower-cost for students
   - Myth #3: CBE programs are lower-cost for higher education institutions

2. Reducing the Costs and Risks of Launch
   - Selecting the right program and learners

3. Personalized Learning Models
   - Hybrid CBE models
   - Personalized learning without CBE
   - Prior Learning Assessment
Picking and Choosing

Hybrid Models Use CBE Elements, Not Entire Model

- BS in Biomedical Sciences
  - Launched Fall 2015 at the new UT Rio Grande Valley
  - Blended online and face-to-face format
- CBE Elements:
  - Curriculum organized around competencies
  - Adaptive tech personalizes online content
- Traditional Elements:
  - Cohort-based
  - Standard pacing

- MS of Health Professions Education
  - Launched Fall 2014
  - Project-based learning with individual mentor; different faculty assign grades
- CBE Elements:
  - Customized learning plan for each student
  - Progress by mastering competencies
- Traditional Elements:
  - Personalized, but not at scale
  - Resembles Oxford tutorial model
Personalized Learning without CBE

16 Ways to Deliver Personalized Learning Without Launching a New CBE Program

I. Content
   - Project-based curriculum
   - Problem-based learning
   - Adaptive technologies
   - Learning analytics
   - Active learning
   - Adaptive release

II. Pacing
   - Self-paced courses
   - Subscription pricing
   - Flexible start dates
   - Emporium-style learning
   - Remedial self-paced modules

III. Assessment
   - Digital portfolios
   - Success coaches
   - Backwards design
   - Skill-based competencies
   - Prior Learning Assessment

Explored in greater depth on the following slides
Mastery of Foundational Concepts

UMBC Administrators Use LMS Analytics to Identify Innovative Faculty

AVP Zeroes In on High-Activity Courses

1. Isolated correlation between LMS engagement and grades
2. Searched for courses with high LMS activity
3. Interviewed instructors of high-activity courses for best practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Hits</th>
<th>Hits per User</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Principles of Accounting</td>
<td>90,893</td>
<td>2,838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Management Ops</td>
<td>32,642</td>
<td>1,632</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structured Systems Analysis</td>
<td>31,026</td>
<td>1,551</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Prof. Hardy Uses Adaptive Release to Ensure Mastery

- Skill critical to course success
- Must pass to unlock course

Early Results Show Lasting Effects
- 20% higher scores on final
- Higher than average GPAs in next course (3.37 vs. 2.76)
- Less than 5 hours course development time

Source: EAB interviews and analysis.
Not All Starting from the Same Place

Self-Paced Modules Support Different Levels of MBA Preparation

Econ major; worked seven years on Wall Street → Test Out Modules
High scores waive requirements

Hasn’t taken math since high school—20 years ago → Self-Paced Tutorials
Can take extra time learning

Health professional; no business background → DIY Self-Assessment
Quizzes show weak points and provides resources

Minimal Faculty Time Required
- Vendor solutions
- Repurpose existing content (self-paced, online)
Beyond the Traditional Credit Award

**Toolkit: The PLA Playbook**

Resources for members building or expanding Prior Learning Assessment programs.

Tools included in *The PLA Playbook*:

Clarifying Prior Learning and Portfolio Processes
- Prior Learning Primer
- PLA Portfolio Process and Risk Maps
- Sample PLA Organizational Models
- PLA Policy Builder

Building and Staffing a PLA Program
- PLA Stakeholder Communication Manual
- Faculty Assessor Training Curriculum
- PLA Landing Page Template

Sample PLA Web Page Template from *The PLA Playbook*
More Information Immediately Available

Download or Order Unlimited Print Copies at www.eab.com

Whitepaper “Three Myths About Competency-Based Education”

Executive-level briefing clarifies misperceptions about the CBE landscape and identifies main challenges of the CBE business model.

Toolkit “The CBE and PLA Playbook”

Decision guides and implementation tools for schools considering, launching, or expanding alternative credit programs

Tools Included in “The CBE and PLA Playbook”

Understanding the CBE Landscape
- Glossary of Common CBE Terms
- Comparison Chart of Key CBE Programs
- Federal Policy FAQ

Launching a Competency-Based Program
- CBE Vendor Quick Reference Guide
- Sample CBE Job Descriptions
- Success Coach Investment Estimator

Deciding if CBE is Right for Your Institution
- CBE Readiness Diagnostic
- Program Development Roadmap
- Credential Selection Guide
- Model CBE Business Case

Clarifying Prior Learning & Portfolio Process
- Prior Learning Primer
- PLA Portfolio Process and Risk Maps
- Sample PLA Org. Models
- PLA Policy Builder

CBE Student Screening and Support
- Student Screening Resources
- Time Mgmt. Worksheets
- Success Coach Triage Guide

Building and Staffing a PLA Program
- PLA Stakeholder Communication Manual
- Faculty Assessor Training Curriculum
- PLA Landing Page Template
For Additional Information

Megan Adams, PhD
Consultant
202-266-5562
madams@eab.com

Kimpton Langford
Manager
202-909-4285
klangford@eab.com
Competency-Based Education
Separating Fact from Fiction

Megan Adams, PhD
Research Consultant
madams@eab.com